

Design Review Board*Minutes*

**Tuesday, March 10, 2020
Council Chambers – Lower Level
57 East 1st Street
4:30 PM**

A work session of the Design Review Board was held at the City of Mesa Council Chamber – Lower Level, 57 East 1st Street at 4:30 p.m.

Board Members Present:

Chair Randy Carter
Vice Chair Scott Thomas
Boardmember Sean Banda
Boardmember Nicole Posten-Thompson
Boardmember J. Seth Placko
Boardmember Jeanette Knudsen
Boardmember Tanner Green

Board Members Absent:**Staff Present:**

Nana Appiah, PhD., AICP, Planning Director
Lesley Davis, Senior Planner
Tom Ellsworth, Principal Planner
Heather Omta, Planning Assistant
Wahid Alam, AICP, Planner II
Ryan McCann, Planner I

Others Present:

Chair Randy Carter welcomed everyone to the Work Session at 4:30 p.m.

- A. Call to Order
- B. Consider the Minutes from the February 11, 2020 meeting
- C. Discuss and Provide Direction Regarding Design Review cases:

This is a preliminary review of Design Review Board cases. The applicant and public may speak about the case, and the Board may provide comments and suggestions to assist the Applicant with the proposal, but the Board will not approve or deny a case under Preliminary Review.

Vote: 7-0

Upon tabulation of vote, it showed:

AYES – Carter–Thomas–Banda–Posten-Thompson–Placko–Knudsen

NAYS – None

Item C.1. DRB19-00542 608 through 616 East Southern Avenue.

District 4. Located east of Mesa Drive on the north side of Southern Avenue. (1± acres). Second review of an exterior remodel of two existing buildings. Casa Maravilla LLC, Applicant; 614 E Southern Ave LLC, Owner.

Staff Planner: Wahid Alam

Staff Planner, Wahid Alam, presented the updated design of the two buildings.

Applicant, Roberto Hernandez, 858 N 97th Street, Mesa, AZ, was available for board questions. Felt the redesign added character to the building.

Chair Carter

- North elevation is plain, not much change in elevation or plane change.
- Asked if the north elevation is just stucco?
 - Applicant, Mr. Hernandez, confirmed the rear plane was stucco
- The north elevation will be visible from Hobson therefore it needs architectural changes.
- Suggested smaller windows on the building that could be located higher up and still provide necessary security and privacy.

Vice Chair Thomas

- No additional comments.

Boardmember Posten-Thompson

- Elements should wrap the entire column on the front of the building, not just the face of the column.
- Prefers the contrast shown on rendering rather than color/material board.
- Wants to make sure the masonry is integrally colored, not just painted onto the masonry. It could be something other than split face block.
- Likes the tower element and the sign.

Boardmember Banda

- Likes the changes to the building.
- Noted that there needs to be breaks in the stucco with control joints.
- The windows are very small, recommends larger windows. Feels there should be more windows to allow for natural light if there is an opportunity.
- Parapet on Building 2 does not return back onto the building itself. Appears to be a western front. There should be a return so that it looks more substantial.
- Look into visibility issues for security into the rear area.

Boardmember Knudsen

- Verify that the lighter tans have a bit of contrast by reviewing larger samples. Shades appear similar in hue.

Boardmember Green

- Noted a concern with the elms they have on the landscape plan in their current locations.

Boardmember Placko

- The proposed Elms on the on the landscape plan will spread out, consider a narrower

tree like Willow Acacia or Bottle Tree.

- Remove Bougainvillea from the walkway, it is a very thorny plant.
- Reduce plant material between parking lot and wall.

Board Summary

1. Return all material around all columns and parapets.
2. Provide more contrast in the colors
3. Make sure stucco panels have control joints to break them up.
4. Consider incorporating some windows to bring natural light into the building and enhance the elevations.
5. Add pre-cast parking bumpers (curb stops) to prevent landscape damage
6. Change north elevation to add additional articulation
7. Parapet to return 12 to 24 inches and wrap finishes.
8. Remove Bougainvillea out of sight visibility triangle and away from pedestrian paths

Item C.2. DRB20-00036 Within the 7800 through 8000 block of East Ray Road.

Council District 6. Located west of Hawes Road on the south side of Ray Road. (41± acres). Requesting the review of seven industrial warehouse buildings. Eric Zitney, Applicant; David Martens, Owner.

Staff Planner: Ryan McCann

Staff Planner, Ryan McCann, presented the case for seven industrial buildings. Currently a vacant site.

Applicant, Eric Zitny from Ware Malcomb, 2777 E. Camelback Rd, Ste. 325, Phoenix, AZ, represented the case and was available for Board questions.

Chair Carter

- Need variation in color from building to building.
- Building architecture is very nice.
- Wants to be able to differentiate between building groups, which could also improve wayfinding.

Vice Chair Thomas

- Confirmed that the truck court wall will be masonry not a formed block.
- Noted it should match what they have done on the other buildings.

Boardmember Posten-Thompson

- Fully agrees that buildings need variation in colors, not huge tone changes but enough to differentiate between groups. Likes the orange accent however want to see building base colors vary.
- Noted that two million square feet of all similar colors is too much of the same palette over and over.
- Likes the forms of the buildings.

Boardmember Banda

- Inquired about the downspouts and asked if they were internal or external?
 - Applicant, Mr. Zitny, confirmed they are internal on the front of the building and external on the back side.

Boardmember Placko

- Avoid Chilean Mesquite in parking lots.

Boardmember Knudsen

- Noted renderings would have been very helpful on these buildings.

Boardmember Green

- No additional comments.

Board Summary

1. Subtle color palette changes.
2. Review site visibility for plant palette with the City to try to retain as much planting as possible.
3. Consider incorporating fractured rock for ground cover material.
4. Downspouts need to be internalized at the corners of the buildings where more visible along Ray Road at both corners.

Item C.3. DRB20-00048 Within the 5200 block of South Ellsworth Road.

Council District 6. Located on the east side of South Ellsworth Road, south of East Ray Road. (1.7± acres). Requesting the review convenience store and fuel station. QuikTrip Corporation, Applicant; PPGN-Ellsworth LLLP, Owner.

Staff Planner: Ryan McCann

Staff Planner, Ryan McCann, presented the case for a new QuikTrip convenience store and fuel station.

Applicant, Charles Huellmantel, PO Box 1833, Tempe, AZ, represented the case and was available to address Board questions.

Chair Carter

- Asked for clarification on the thought process on the use of stainless steel.
 - Applicant stated they are trying to find new ways to incorporate the QuikTrip look on a building that does not meet their standard design. The building design is responding to its location in the Cadence Community.
- Get away from the heavy cornice with a more modern look.

Vice Chair Thomas

- Noted that all the grey at the top of the canopy will be shiny stainless steel.
- The red bar on the canopy needs to be a solid piece rather than small pieces to create a cleaner look.

Boardmember Posten-Thompson

- Oversized cornice that looks like chrome doesn't go with the dry stack stone.
- Doesn't mind the stainless-steel awning.
- Does not like the window signs.
- Concerned this building will set a precedent for Cadence.
- Suggested they utilize Cadence materials and colors on the form of the QuikTrip constructed at the northeast corner of Mesa Drive and Baseline Road.
- Change the color of the windscreen.

Boardmember Knudson

- No comments to add.

Boardmember Banda

- Noted site lighting needs to be enhanced design and consistent with the overall development.
- Doesn't care for the size of the canopy over the side door. Would like to see it wider.

Boardmember Green

- Agrees that a color scheme and material change will help.
- Thought the canopy on the side should be wider to match the store at Mesa Drive and Baseline Road.
- Noted that on the Mesa Drive and Baseline Road store there is a column on either side of the awning on the front. He would like to see this column incorporated into the design on this building.

Board Summary:

1. Revise the building design to be more similar to the QuikTrip design at 1939 S Mesa Drive in Mesa. The design presented has a conflicting style and design. The design needs to be up to the Cadence standards because it will be setting a precedence for Cadence.
2. Color scheme changes – keep the colors of Mesa Drive and introduce a lighter beige to compliment Cadence colors
3. Widen side door canopy
4. Lighting to match the quality development design guidelines and Cadence Community standards.
5. Revise the cornice to be more similar to the Mesa Drive building design
6. Pedestrian paths are to be decorative surface consistent with the design that will be installed in the surrounding Cadence commercial development and not painted stripes.
7. Continuous metal red band needs to be a solid material on the canopies rather than shorter sections pieced together to avoid a choppy red band.

D. Provide comments and make recommendation to the City Council on the following:

Item D.1. DRB20-00081 Within the 4000 block of South Power Road (east side).
Council District 6. Located north of Warner Road on the east side of Power Road. (25± acres). Requesting the review of design guidelines for a large-scale commercial recreation development. Ralph Pew, Applicant; Cono Vertuccio, Owner.

Staff Planner: Lisa Davis

Staff Recommendation: Withdrawn by Applicant

Item D.1. was withdrawn by the applicant and was not heard at the meeting.

E. Adjournment
Meeting was adjourned without objection at 6:15 pm.

Vote: 7-0

Upon tabulation of vote, it showed:

AYES – Carter–Thomas–Banda–Posten–Thompson–Placko–Knudsen

NAYS – None

The City of Mesa is committed to making its public meetings accessible to persons with disabilities. For special accommodations, please contact the City Manager's Office at (480) 644- 3333 or AzRelay 7-1-1 at least 48 hours in advance of the meeting. **Si necesita asistencia o traducción en español, favor de llamar al menos 48 horas antes de la reunión al 480-644- 2767.**